

# **Comparative Analysis of AI Guidelines in Professional Counseling:**

### **Evaluation of Emerging Standards in Al-Assisted Mental Health Care**

The National Board for Certified Counselors has undertaken a comparative analysis of Artificial Intelligence (AI) guidelines across major counseling organizations. The evaluation revealed several key similarities and important distinctions in their approaches to AI integration in counseling practice. The five major counseling organizations that have issued AI guidance include:

#### **National Board for Certified Counselors (NBCC)**

**Ethical Principles for Artificial Intelligence in Counseling** 

#### **American Counseling Association (ACA)**

Recommendations For Practicing Counselors and Their Use Of Al
Artificial Intelligence, Assessment, & Diagnosis
Further Recommendations Regarding The Future Of Al In Counseling

#### **American Mental Health Counselors Association (AMHCA)**

AMHCA Code of Ethics Addendum: Addressing Artificial Intelligence: 2023

#### The Association for Addiction Professionals (NAADAC)

The National Certification Commission for Addiction Professionals Code of Ethics

#### **American Association of State Counseling Boards (AASCB)**

Supporting the Safe and Ethical Use of Al in Mental Health Counseling

### **Key Similarities Among Counseling Organizations**

	NBCC	ACA	AMHCA	NAADAC	AASCB	
Primacy of Human Relationship and Professional Judgment	<ul> <li>All organizations emphasize that the therapeutic relationship must remain central and uncompromised by Al integration</li> <li>Consistent agreement that Al tools should enhance rather than replace professional clinical judgment</li> <li>Consistent emphasis on counselor accountability for client outcomes</li> <li>Shared emphasis on maintaining the interpersonal nature of counseling</li> <li>Universal recognition that Al serves a supportive rather than primary role in treatment</li> <li>Common focus on preserving the essential human elements of therapeutic interaction</li> </ul>					
Client Protection and Rights	<ul> <li>Comprehensive requirements for informed consent regarding AI use in treatment</li> <li>Detailed provisions for protecting client privacy and confidentiality</li> <li>Shared emphasis on client autonomy in deciding whether to participate in AI-assisted services</li> <li>Common focus on transparent communication about AI capabilities and limitations</li> <li>Universal requirement to prioritize client welfare over technological efficiency</li> <li>Shared commitment to protecting vulnerable populations from AI-related risks</li> </ul>					
Data Security and Privacy Standards	<ul> <li>Rigorous requirements for HIPAA compliance in AI applications</li> <li>Shared emphasis on secure data storage and transmission</li> <li>Common standards for data encryption and protection</li> <li>Universal guidelines for controlling access to AI-processed client information</li> <li>Consistent requirements for secure deletion of client data when no longer needed</li> <li>Shared protocols for handling data breaches or security incidents</li> </ul>					
Professional Competency Requirements	<ul> <li>Comprehensive understanding of AI capabilities and limitations required before implementation</li> <li>Ongoing professional development requirements regarding AI technologies</li> <li>Shared emphasis on understanding ethical implications of AI use</li> <li>Common requirement for demonstrated proficiency in AI-assisted tools</li> <li>Universal focus on maintaining clinical expertise independent of AI assistance</li> <li>Shared commitment to staying current with AI developments and best practices</li> </ul>					
Ethical Decision-Making Framework	<ul><li>Shared requiremen</li><li>Common focus on</li><li>Universal guideline</li><li>Shared emphasis of</li></ul>	sis on applying established to for regular evaluation of balancing innovation with some for handling ethical dile on documentation of Al-rech to risk assessment and	h client protection emmas involving Al elated decisions	I integration		

Quality Assurance and Monitoring			
Cultural Competency and Bias Prevention	<ul> <li>Universal recognition of potential AI bias and discrimination</li> <li>Shared commitment to ensuring AI tools are culturally responsive</li> <li>Common requirements for assessing AI tools for cultural sensitivity</li> <li>Consistent emphasis on serving diverse populations effectively</li> <li>Shared focus on preventing algorithmic bias in clinical applications</li> <li>Universal guidelines for culturally appropriate AI implementation</li> </ul>		
Professional Boundaries and Responsibilities	<ul> <li>Clear delineation of counselor responsibilities when using Al tools</li> <li>Shared emphasis on maintaining professional boundaries</li> <li>Common guidelines for appropriate scope of Al use</li> <li>Universal focus on counselor accountability</li> <li>Shared protocols for supervision and consultation regarding Al</li> <li>Consistent standards for professional conduct in Al-assisted practice</li> </ul>		
Research and Evidence-Based Practice	<ul> <li>Shared commitment to evidence-based implementation of AI tools</li> <li>Common emphasis on contributing to AI research in counseling</li> <li>Universal focus on evaluating AI effectiveness</li> <li>Shared requirement for staying informed about AI research</li> <li>Consistent approach to integrating research findings into practice</li> <li>Common guidelines for participating in AI-related research</li> </ul>		
Client Education and Empowerment	<ul> <li>Universal emphasis on educating clients about AI use in treatment</li> <li>Shared focus on empowering clients to make informed decisions</li> <li>Common guidelines for discussing AI limitations and capabilities</li> <li>Consistent approach to addressing client concerns about AI</li> <li>Shared commitment to maintaining client autonomy</li> <li>Universal requirements for ongoing client communication about AI use</li> </ul>		

## Notable Differences Among Counseling Organizations in Al Guidance

	NBCC	ACA	АМНСА	NAADAC	AASCB
	Framework	Framework	Framework	Framework	Framework
Scope and Specificity	<ul> <li>Provides comprehensive, step-by-step implementation guidelines</li> <li>Includes specific procedural requirements for Al integration</li> <li>Offers detailed protocols for different clinical scenarios</li> <li>Maintains strict alignment with existing ethical frameworks</li> <li>Establishes clear boundaries for Al tool utilization</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Centers core ethical principles and theoretical foundations</li> <li>Focuses on adaptable guidelines that can evolve with technology</li> <li>Encourages professional judgment in Al application</li> <li>Promotes innovative approaches to Al integration</li> <li>Emphasizes the importance of research-based decision making</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Concentrates specifically on technology-supported counseling</li> <li>Emphasizes practical implementation in clinical settings</li> <li>Provides targeted guidance for specific technology applications</li> <li>Focuses on immediate clinical concerns and solutions</li> <li>Maintains a narrower scope of technological consideration</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Applies traditional ethical principles to new technology</li> <li>Takes a more generalized approach to AI integration</li> <li>Emphasizes flexibility in application</li> <li>Focuses on fundamental counseling principles</li> <li>Maintains broader interpretative guidelines</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Centers on public protection and regulatory compliance</li> <li>Establishes minimum standards for Al use in licensed practice</li> <li>Provides specific guidelines for scope of practice boundaries</li> <li>Focuses on risk management and liability considerations</li> <li>Emphasizes state-specific regulatory requirements</li> </ul>
Implementation Strategy	Systematic Approach  Provides detailed implementation timelines  Includes specific compliance checkpoints  Offers structured assessment tools  Establishes clear accountability measures  Maintains comprehensive documentation requirements	Research-Based  • Emphasizes evidence-based implementation  • Promotes pilot testing and evaluation  • Encourages continuous assessment and adaptation  • Focuses on outcome measurement  • Supports innovative implementation methods	Client-Centered  Prioritizes client autonomy in technology adoption  Emphasizes informed consent processes  Focuses on practical application in clinical settings  Maintains emphasis on safety and effectiveness  Promotes transparent communication about technology use	Principle-Based  Adapts existing frameworks to new technology  Emphasizes professional judgment  Maintains focus on core ethical principles  Promotes flexible implementation approaches  Emphasizes practitioner discretion	Compliance-Focused  Requires documented compliance with state regulations  Establishes clear boundaries for AI use in clinical practice  Mandates specific documentation requirements  Creates standardized reporting procedures  Emphasizes liability protection and risk management

	NBCC	ACA	АМНСА	NAADAC	AASCB
	Structured Training	Research-Oriented Approach	Practical Skill Development	Cultural Competency Focus	Licensure-Oriented Training
Professional Development	<ul> <li>Requires specific Al competency benchmarks</li> <li>Maintains detailed supervision requirements</li> <li>Establishes clear training pathways</li> <li>Includes assessment of technological competence</li> <li>Requires ongoing professional development</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Emphasizes understanding of empirical evidence</li> <li>Promotes research participation</li> <li>Focuses on evidence- based practice</li> <li>Encourages innovative approaches</li> <li>Supports continuous learning</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Focuses on immediate clinical application</li> <li>Emphasizes safety and risk management</li> <li>Promotes practical technology skills</li> <li>Maintains focus on client protection</li> <li>Emphasizes hands-on experience</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Emphasizes cultural awareness in technology use</li> <li>Promotes bias recognition and mitigation</li> <li>Focuses on diverse population needs</li> <li>Maintains emphasis on inclusive practice</li> <li>Supports culturally sensitive implementation</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Establishes minimum Al competency requirements for licensure</li> <li>Defines continuing education requirements for Al use</li> <li>Specifies supervision requirements for Al-assisted practice</li> <li>Requires demonstration of Al competency for license renewal</li> <li>Mandates regular updates on Al-related skills and knowledge</li> </ul>
	Assessment-Focused Research	Comprehensive Research Agenda	Applied Research	Evaluation-Centered Approach	Evidence-Based Standards
Research and Innovation	<ul> <li>Emphasizes testing and validation studies</li> <li>Focuses on practical application research</li> <li>Maintains emphasis on measurement accuracy</li> <li>Promotes standardized assessment approaches</li> <li>Supports evidence-based tool development</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Promotes extensive research initiatives</li> <li>Encourages innovation in Al applications</li> <li>Supports experimental approaches</li> <li>Emphasizes outcome measurement</li> <li>Promotes collaborative research efforts</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Focuses on clinical effectiveness studies</li> <li>Emphasizes practical outcomes</li> <li>Promotes real-world application research</li> <li>Maintains focus on safety studies</li> <li>Supports practice-based evidence</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Emphasizes assessment of existing tools</li> <li>Focuses on outcome evaluation</li> <li>Promotes practical effectiveness research</li> <li>Maintains emphasis on quality measurement</li> <li>Supports continuous improvement studies</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Requires validation of AI tools used in licensed practice</li> <li>Emphasizes protection of public interest in AI adoption</li> <li>Establishes criteria for acceptable AI applications</li> <li>Focuses on regulatory compliance in research applications</li> <li>Maintains emphasis on client protection in innovation</li> </ul>